



Consultant Selection

Interview Process

Pilot Program

April 23, 2003



UDOT Consultant Services Memo

DATE: April 23, 2003

SUBJECT: Consultant Selection – Interview Process
Pilot Program

In February of 2003 the Utah Department of Transportation created a Quality Improvement Team called the Consultant Selection – Interview Process Quality Improvement Team (CSIPT). The CSIPT was chartered to review the interview process and scoring method the Department uses to select consultants for engineering services. The scope of the CSIPT was from the time consultants are short-listed based on their scores from the Statements of Qualifications until the consultant selection is made. The CSIPT had representatives from the Department Central Office & Regions, FHWA, and the ACEC.

The CSIPT developed a new interview process format and scoring method during March and April of 2003. The Department will now test these new processes in a pilot program over the next six to twelve months in at least three consultant selections.

The sequence of each interview will be the following.

- Short Presentation – Optional
- Clarification Questions (5 min) - Optional
- Question and Answer Period
- Consultant Summation and Comment Period

The major changes the Department will test under the Consultant Selection Interview Pilot Program (Pilot Program) are the following.

- The scores from Consultants' Statements of Qualifications will count for a percentage of the final selection score. The CSIPT set the percentage during the Pilot Program at 30%. The Department will continue to determine during the Department Selection Team (DST) Meeting whether or not interviews are necessary prior to consultant selection.
- The DST will determine on a project-by-project basis during the DST Meeting the weights for the short presentation, question and answer period, and

Consultant Selection – Interview Process

April 23, 2003

Page 2

consultant summation and comment period. The DST will not be using the CBA (Choosing By Advantage) method for the final consultant selection.

- The DST will determine on a project-by-project basis during the DST Meeting whether they would like consultants to present a short presentation at the beginning of the interview and what level of visual aids will be allowed. In addition the DST will determine the weight of the presentation in the final selection score, range 0 – 20%.
- The DST will determine on a project-by-project basis during the DST Meeting the weight of the Question & Answer and Summation & Comment Period, range 50 – 70% and the weight of each question and the Summation & Comment Period.

At the end of the Pilot Program, the CSIPT will meet again and discuss the lessons learned. Based on those lessons, the CSIPT will revise the process, update the UDOT Consultant Services Manual of Instructions, and fully implement the new process.

If you have any questions, please reference more specific information on the Pilot Program at <http://www.dot.state.ut.us/esd/ConsultantServices/Memos/PilotProgram.htm>, or contact Gaye Hettrick, UDOT Consultant Contract Specialist, at 801-965-4639 or ghettrick@utah.gov.

UDOT Consultant Selection Team Interview Format Worksheet Form

Project Number: _____

Name / Location of Project: _____

The Utah Department of Transportation Selection Team (Team) has determined interviews are necessary prior to selecting a consultant for the above project. This form will assist the Team in determining the format of these interviews.

Date & Location of Interview:

Interviews will be held on _____ (date), at _____ (location).

Short-listed Firms:

The Department will be interviewing the following firms (two to five):

List Firms

- (Firm A) _____
- (Firm B) _____
- (Firm C) _____
- (Firm D) _____
- (Firm E) _____

Format:

The following items are standard in consultant selection interviews.

- Up to five key consultant personnel are allowed to attend the interview, one of which must be the Consultant Project Manager.
- Each consultant attendee should have a visible name identification tag.
- Principals of a company are not allowed to attend the interview unless they are a key person on the project.
- Consultants will not be given the questions in advance of the interview.
- All consultants will be asked the same questions.
- Each consultant interview will be a maximum of 60 minutes including presentation, question and answer, and summation and comment periods.
- The consultant will be given five (5) minutes at the end of the interview for summation and comment.

UDOT Consultant Selection Team Interview Format Worksheet Form

Short Presentation - Optional:

Do you want consultants to prepare a Short Presentation on their qualifications/approach to the project? _____ (Yes / No)

If yes, check what level of visual aids consultants will be allowed to use during their Short Presentation.

- No visual aids
- Use of whiteboard
- Graphics from their Statement of Qualifications (SOQ)
- Hand-outs
- _____ (0 - 3) Pre-prepared presentation boards
(Boards will be a standard size of 24" x 36")

Time Lengths and Sequence of Interviews:

List time lengths for each section of the interview. The times should correspond to the weights assigned to each section. The interviews will be conducted in the sequence order listed below.

Minutes

- _____ (0 – 10 min.) Short Presentation – Optional
- 5 min (0 or 5 min.) Follow-up / Clarification Questions to Short Presentation
- _____ (0 – 55 min.) Question and Answer period
- 5 min (5 min.) Consultant Summation and Comment period
- 60 min Total (60 min. maximum)

Final Selection Score - Weights:

Statements of Qualifications (SOQ's) are now part of the final scoring. Please enter weights you want assigned to the following. Weights should correspond to the time allowed for each section. (Note: Consultant Summation and Comment Section is considered part of the Question and Answer Period for scoring purposes.)

- 30 % SOQ is 30 % of final score
- _____ (Short Presentation weight, range 0 - 20 % of final score)
- _____ (Question and Answer period weight, range 50 – 70 % of final score)
- 100 % Total

UDOT Consultant Selection Team Interview Format Worksheet Form

Develop Topics for Questions:

List possible topics of questions you may be asking.

- (Topic) _____

Develop Questions:

All consultants will be asked the same questions. The recommended number of questions is between 3 and 7, dependent on time allowed for this section. From questions asked in the past, you can estimate each question and the Consultant's response will take approximately 7-8 minutes. Once the questions are developed, you will need to assign a weight to each question and to the Summation and Comment period. The total weight for the Question & Answer and Summation & Comment Section is ten.

<u>Weight</u>	<u>Questions (3-7)</u>
• _____	1. _____ _____ _____
• _____	2. _____ _____ _____
• _____	3. _____ _____ _____

UDOT Consultant Selection Team Interview Format Worksheet Form

• _____ 4. _____

• _____ 5. _____

• _____ 6. _____

• _____ 7. _____

• _____ Consultant Summation and Comment

 10 Total (*Range of 50 – 70 % of final score*)

<Date>

UDOT Selection Team Interviews

Project No. <>
<Description>

Statements of Qualifications (SOQ's)

SOQ's	Max. Pts. Possible	Firm A	Firm B	Firm C	Firm D	Firm E
		Points	Points	Points	Points	Points
Total	100					

Points

Range 0 -100, Points are determined by averaging individual Selection Team members' scores prior to the Selection Team Meeting.

Short Presentation Section - Optional

Presentation	Pres. Weight	Max. Pts. Possible	Firm A		Firm B		Firm C		Firm D		Firm E	
			Score	Points								
Total	10	100		0		0		0		0		0

Score

Range 0 -10, 0 = Unacceptable, 10 = Excellent, Selection Team determines points by consensus after interviews.

Points

Range 0 - 100, "Points" = "Presentation Weight" x "Score"

Question and Answer Section

Question	Question Weight	Max. Pts. Possible	Firm A		Firm B		Firm C		Firm D		Firm E	
			Score	Points								
Question 1		0		0		0		0		0		0
Question 2		0		0		0		0		0		0
Question 3		0		0		0		0		0		0
Question 4		0		0		0		0		0		0
Question 5		0		0		0		0		0		0
Summation & Comment		0		0		0		0		0		0
Avg/Total	0	0	#DIV/0!	0	#DIV/0!	0	#DIV/0!	0	#DIV/0!	0	#DIV/0!	0

Weights of Questions and Summation & Comment

Range 0 - 4, Total of 10, 0 = Question was not asked, 4 = Vital question, Selection Team determines weights during the Selection Team Meeting.

Score

Range 0 - 10, 0 = Unacceptable, 10 = Excellent, Selection Team determines ranks by consensus after interviews.

Points

Range 0 - 100, "Points" = "Question Weight" x "Score"

Avg

Range 0 - 10, Average of "Score" of questions, for information only.

<Date>

UDOT Selection Team Final Scores

Project No. <>
<Description>

Weights

Elements	Percentage of Final Score*	Maximum Points Possible	Weight**
SOQ's	30	100	0.30
Presentation		100	0.00
Q & A and S & C		100	0.00

Ranges

* Presentation Range = 0 - 20%, Question & Answer and Summation & Comment Range = 50 - 70%

** Presentation Range = 0 - 0.2, Question & Answer and Summation & Comment Range = 0.5 - 0.7

Final Scores

Element	Weight	Max. Pts. Possible	Firm A		Firm B		Firm C		Firm D		Firm E	
			Points	Weighted Points								
SOQ's	0.30	30	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00
Presentation	0.00	0	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00
Q & A and S & C	0.00	0	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00	0	0.00
Final Ranking / Score		30	1	0.00								

Weighted Points

"Weighted Points" = "Weight" x "Points"

UDOT Consultant Selection Team Interview Format Worksheet Form

Project Number: Example _____

Name / Location of Project: _____

The Utah Department of Transportation Selection Team (Team) has determined interviews are necessary prior to selecting a consultant for the above project. This form will assist the Team in determining the format of these interviews.

Date & Location of Interview:

Interviews will be held on _____ (date), at _____ (location).

Short-listed Firms:

The Department will be interviewing the following firms (two to five):

List Firms

- (Firm A) _____
- (Firm B) _____
- (Firm C) _____
- (Firm D) _____
- (Firm E) _____

Format:

The following items are standard in consultant selection interviews.

- Up to five key consultant personnel are allowed to attend the interview, one of which must be the Consultant Project Manager.
- Each consultant attendee should have a visible name identification tag.
- Principals of a company are not allowed to attend the interview unless they are a key person on the project.
- Consultants will not be given the questions in advance of the interview.
- All consultants will be asked the same questions.
- Each consultant interview will be a maximum of 60 minutes including presentation, question and answer, and summation and comment periods.
- The consultant will be given five (5) minutes at the end of the interview for summation and comment.

UDOT Consultant Selection Team Interview Format Worksheet Form

Short Presentation - Optional:

Do you want consultants to prepare a Short Presentation on their qualifications/approach to the project? Yes (Yes / No)

If yes, check what level of visual aids consultants will be allowed to use during their Short Presentation.

- No visual aids
- Use of whiteboard
- Graphics from their Statement of Qualifications (SOQ)
- Hand-outs
- 3 (0 - 3) Pre-prepared presentation boards
(Boards will be a standard size of 24" x 36")

Time Lengths and Sequence of Interviews:

List time lengths for each section of the interview. The times should correspond to the weights assigned to each section. The interviews will be conducted in the sequence order listed below.

Minutes

- 10 min (0 – 10 min.) Short Presentation – Optional
- 5 min (0 or 5 min.) Follow-up / Clarification Questions to Short Presentation
- 40 min (0 – 55 min.) Question and Answer period
- 5 min (5 min.) Consultant Summation and Comment period
- 60 min Total (60 min. maximum)

Final Selection Score - Weights:

Statements of Qualifications (SOQ's) are now part of the final scoring. Please enter weights you want assigned to the following. Weights should correspond to the time allowed for each section. (Note: Consultant Summation and Comment Section is considered part of the Question and Answer Period for scoring purposes.)

- 30 % SOQ is 30 % of final score
- 15 % (Short Presentation weight, range 0 - 20 % of final score)
- 55 % (Question and Answer period weight, range 50 – 70 % of final score)
- 100 % Total

UDOT Consultant Selection Team Interview Format Worksheet Form

Develop Topics for Questions:

List possible topics of questions you may be asking.

- (Topic) Topic 1
- (Topic) Topic 2
- (Topic) Topic 3
- (Topic) Topic 4
- (Topic) _____

Develop Questions:

All consultants will be asked the same questions. The recommended number of questions is between 3 and 7, dependent on time allowed for this section. From questions asked in the past, you can estimate each question and the Consultant's response will take approximately 7-8 minutes. Once the questions are developed, you will need to assign a weight to each question and to the Summation and Comment period. The total weight for the Question & Answer and Summation & Comment Section is ten.

<u>Weight</u>	<u>Questions (3-7)</u>	
• <u> 1 </u>	1.	<u>Question One</u> _____ _____ _____
• <u> 2 </u>	2.	<u>Question Two</u> _____ _____ _____
• <u> 1 </u>	3.	<u>Question Three</u> _____ _____ _____

UDOT Consultant Selection Team Interview Format Worksheet Form

• 3 4. Question Four

• 2 5. Question Five

• 0 6. N/A

• 0 7. N/A

• 1 Consultant Summation and Comment

 10 Total (*Range of 50 – 70 % of final score*)

<Date>

UDOT Selection Team Interviews

Project No. <>
<Description>

Statements of Qualifications (SOQ's)

SOQ's	Max. Pts. Possible	Firm A	Firm B	Firm C	Firm D	Firm E
		Points	Points	Points	Points	Points
Total	100	90	89	92	91	88

Points

Range 0 -100, Points are determined by averaging individual Selection Team members' scores prior to the Selection Team Meeting.

Short Presentation Section - Optional

Presentation	Pres. Weight	Max. Pts. Possible	Firm A		Firm B		Firm C		Firm D		Firm E	
			Score	Points								
Total	10	100	10	100	9	90	8	80	9	90	9.5	95

Score

Range 0 -10, 0 = Unacceptable, 10 = Excellent, Selection Team determines points by consensus after interviews.

Points

Range 0 - 100, "Points" = "Presentation Weight" x "Score"

Question and Answer Section

Question	Question Weight	Max. Pts. Possible	Firm A		Firm B		Firm C		Firm D		Firm E	
			Score	Points								
Question 1	1	10	9	9	9	9	8	8	7	7	10	10
Question 2	2	20	9	18	8	16	8	16	7	14	8	16
Question 3	1	10	8	8	7	7	8	8	7	7	7	7
Question 4	3	30	7	21	6	18	8	24	6	18	9	27
Question 5	2	20	9	18	5	10	8	16	5	10	2	4
Summation & Comment	1	10	10	10	10	10	8	8	9	9	10	10
Avg/Total	10	100	8.67	84	7.50	70	8.00	80	6.83	65	7.67	74

Weights of Questions and Summation & Comment

Range 0 - 4, Total of 10, 0 = Question was not asked, 4 = Vital question, Selection Team determines weights during the Selection Team Meeting.

Score

Range 0 - 10, 0 = Unacceptable, 10 = Excellent, Selection Team determines ranks by consensus after interviews.

Points

Range 0 - 100, "Points" = "Question Weight" x "Score"

Avg

Range 0 - 10, Average of "Score" of questions, for information only.

<Date>

UDOT Selection Team Final Scores

Project No. <>
<Description>

Weights

Elements	Percentage of Final Score*	Maximum Points Possible	Weight**
SOQ's	30	100	0.30
Presentation	15	100	0.15
Q & A and S & C	55	100	0.55

Ranges

* Presentation Range = 0 - 20%, Question & Answer and Summation & Comment Range = 50 - 70%

** Presentation Range = 0 - 0.2, Question & Answer and Summation & Comment Range = 0.5 - 0.7

Final Scores

Element	Weight	Max. Pts. Possible	Firm A		Firm B		Firm C		Firm D		Firm E	
			Points	Weighted Points								
SOQ's	0.30	30	90	27.00	89	26.70	92	27.60	91	27.30	88	26.40
Presentation	0.15	15	100	15.00	90	13.50	80	12.00	90	13.50	95	14.25
Q & A and S & C	0.55	55	84	46.20	70	38.50	80	44.00	65	35.75	74	40.70
Final Ranking / Score		100	1	88.20	4	78.70	2	83.60	5	76.55	3	81.35

Weighted Points

"Weighted Points" = "Weight" x "Points"